# EXHIBIT A

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

#### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT) ANTITRUST LITIGATION

VIEWSONIC CORPORATION

Plaintiff,

vs.

CHUNGHWA PICTURE TUBES, LTD., et al.,

Defendants.

Master File No. 3:07-cv-05944-SC

MDL No. 1917

Individual Case No. 14-cv-02510

**REPORT OF ALAN S. FRANKEL, Ph.D.** 

June 6, 2014

#### 1. Introduction

#### 1.1. Assignment

- 1. ViewSonic Corporation ("ViewSonic") was incorporated in California in 1987 as Keypoint Technology Corporation. <sup>1</sup> It is headquartered in Walnut, California. <sup>2</sup> Keypoint introduced the ViewSonic brand of color computer monitors in 1990, and the company soon adopted that name. <sup>3</sup>
- 2. During the period at issue in this case, ViewSonic purchased "CRT Products" in ViewSonic's case, computer monitors that contained cathode ray tubes ("CRTs"), which ViewSonic distributed to various types of resellers throughout the United States.<sup>4</sup> ViewSonic was the sixth leading brand of CRT monitors sold in the United States in 1997.<sup>5</sup>
- 3. ViewSonic alleges that the Defendants and alleged co-conspirators colluded in setting prices of CRTs and that this caused ViewSonic to pay higher prices for CRT Products than it would have paid absent the conspiracy.<sup>6</sup>
- 4. I have been asked by counsel for ViewSonic to: (1) calculate damages under the assumption that the Defendants are found to be liable in this litigation; (2) assume that the alleged conspiracy resulted in anticompetitive overcharges for CRTs the tubes incorporated into the CRT Products purchased by ViewSonic as determined by Dr. James McClave, another

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Funding Universe, "ViewSonic Corporation History," <a href="http://www.fundinguniverse.com/company-histories/viewsonic-corporation-history/">http://www.fundinguniverse.com/company-histories/viewsonic-corporation-history/</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ViewSonic SEC Form 10-K for the year ended December 31, 2005, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Funding Universe, "ViewSonic Corporation History," <a href="http://www.fundinguniverse.com/company-histories/viewsonic-corporation-history/">http://www.fundinguniverse.com/company-histories/viewsonic-corporation-history/</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> ViewSonic SEC Form 10-K for the year ended December 31, 2005, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> United States Environmental Protection Agency, "Computer Display Industry and Technology Profile," December 1998, EPA 744-R-98-005, p.8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Complaint, in *ViewSonic Corporation v. Chunghwa Picture Tubes, Ltd., et al.*, ¶¶2, 84, 245-46. The conclusions and computations that I present in this report would either be unaffected by changes to the current Defendants and co-conspirators or could be modified through simple adjustments as described in this report to account for such changes.

# Case 4:07-cv-05944-JST Document 3102-2 Filed 11/14/14 Page 4 of 6 HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

conspiracy, and before and after adjusting for inflation, are shown in Exhibit 17 and summarized in Exhibit 20a, with additional detail shown in Exhibit 20b.

June 6, 2014

Alan S. Frankel, Ph.D.

Exhibit 15 - Vendors Designated as "Direct" Purchases

Plaintiff	Conspirator	Direct Vendor Names Appearing in Data		
Viewsonic	Daewoo	WEIHAI DAEWOO ELECTRONICS CO, LTD		
	Jean Co	Jean Co Ltd		
		JCL		
	LGE	LG ELECTRONICS INC.		
		LGEI		
	Panasonic	MJ		
		MT		
	Tatung	TAT		
		TATUNG		

## Case 4:07-cv-05944-JST Document 3102-2 Filed 11/14/14 Page 6 of 6

### Exhibit 20b - Damages Detail

			Before Inflation Adjustment		After Inflation Adjustment	
			Before Market	After Market	Before Market	After Market
			Share	Share	Share	Share
	Product	Vendors	Adjustment	Adjustment	Adjustment	Adjustment
		Total Direct	\$167,744,897	\$152,673,471	\$269,282,981	\$244,985,804
		Daewoo	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
		Jean Co	\$48,653,155	\$44,115,106	\$77,541,773	\$70,294,727
ViewSonic	Monitors	LGE	\$14,630,944	\$13,280,100	\$23,251,111	\$21,102,723
		Panasonic	\$71,134,648	\$63,771,251	\$115,849,102	\$103,854,359
		Tatung	\$15,614,325	\$15,017,305	\$23,970,302	\$23,041,580
		Unallocated Direct	\$17,711,825	\$16,489,709	\$28,670,694	\$26,692,416